THE SCHOOL COMMITTEE OF THE CITY OF BOSTON



Minutes of the English Language Learners (ELL) Task Force Meeting February 14, 2019

The English Language Learners Task Force of the Boston School Committee held a meeting on February 14, 2019 at 9:00 am at Bruce Bolling Building. For more information about any of the items listed below, contact Jen Douglas, ELL Task Force Coordinator, at <u>bpselltaskforce@gmail.com</u>.

ATTENDEES

ELL Task Force Members present: Jen Douglas (coordinator), Suzanne Lee (co-chair), Katie Li, Julia Mejia, John Mudd, Alex Oliver-Dávila, Rev. Cheng Imm Tan,

BPS Staff present: Dr. Charles Grandson (Chief Academic Officer), Priya Tahiliani (Assistant Superintendent, Office of English Learners (OEL)), Alberto Carrero (Instruction Specialist, OEL), Ivy Jones (OEL), Faye Karp (Director of Data and Fiscal Accountability, OEL), Genevieve McDonough (Instructional Specialist, OEL), Kim Tsai (Director of Legal Compliance, OEL), Anu Jayanth (Director, Office of Grants and External Funding), Nathan Kuder (Deputy Chief Financial Officer, Office of Finance), David Bloom (Budget Director, Budget Office), Emily Qazilbash (Assistant Superintendent, Office of Human Capital (OHC)), Amanda Preston-Sicari (Director of Recruitment, OHC), Jon Barrows (Director, Data & Analytics, OHC)

Other attendees: Roger Rice (META), Alan Jay Rom (META)

HANDOUTS

From ELLTF

- Minutes of the ELLTF Meeting on November 8, 2018
- Minutes of the ELLTF Meeting on December 20, 2018
- Subcommittee Operations Packet
- ELL Task Force Follow-Up Items Tracking List, February 14, 2019 version

From Office of English Learners

• "OEL Update for EL Task Force: DOJ and Budget," Priya Tahiliani, Assistant Superintendent. February 14, 2019

From Office of Engagement

 Opportunity Index Partnership Fund handouts: "All Schools Who Received FY19 Partnership Funds, with their Selected Partners," "Partners Funded through the Partnership Fund in FY19, with Schools," "Total Partnership Funds by Partner FY18-FY19"

From Finance Office

• "Title I Spending for English Learner Students," Anu Jayanth. February 14, 2019.

From Finance and Budget Offices

- "Department and Program Detail English Learners, FY2019–FY2020 All Funds," February 6, 2019.
- "Account Detail for Programs, Departments, and Accounts Supporting English Learners, FY2019–FY2020 All Funds," February 6, 2019.
- "FY20 Budget Collaborative and Probable Organization Guidance Document," December 8, 2018

From Office of Human Capital

- "SEI Classroom Vacancy Data," Boston Public Schools Office of Human Capital. January 30, 2018
- "BPS Staff Language Data Interim Report II," Boston Public Schools Office of Human Capital and Office of English Language Learners. May 15, 2018
- "BPS Staff Language Data Report III," Boston Public Schools Office of Human Capital and Office of English Language Learners. October 29, 2018

From Office of Human Capital and ELLTF Human Capital Subcommittee

• "SY 2018-19 ELL Task Force Human Capital Subcommittee Priorities." November 15, 2018

Other

 Letter from Cabo Verdean community representatives "RE: Language of Instruction for Cabo Verdean Bilingual Programs," sent to Zhaneta Liti, Language Acquisition Support Lead at the Office of Language Acquisition, Center for Instructional Support at Massachusetts Department of Elementary and Secondary Education, September 4, 2018.

CONSOLIDATED LIST OF FOLLOW-UP ITEMS THAT EMERGED IN THE MEETING

- 1. Obtain info about Promise Act from Alex and share with TF members.
- 2. Nominate four TF members as candidates for the public panels involved in the superintendent hire process.
- 3. Speak with John to determine use of this trend data on ELD levels over time. Make data request.
- 4. Rev. Tan and Priya may want to follow up on the conversation about whether dollars budgeted for Dual Language Chinese at the Quincy Upper will be sufficient.
- 5. Learn from OEL which schools will implement pilot projects made possible by the LOOK Act.
- 6. Request from Budget a breakdown of the costs covered by external funds and any other questions.
- 7. Provide OHC with guidance on what a policy statement from the top on staff language capacity might look like.
- 8. Create a place online where all data requests are listed.
- 9. Jen to schedule the meeting Ad-hoc Multilingual Multicultural BPS group has requested with BPS staff.

FULL DISCUSSION

1. Welcome and introductions

2. Approval of meeting minutes from November 8 and December 20, 2018

3. Chairs' Report

Oliver-Dávila: It would be good to be well-versed in the Promise Act and the Governor's bill and one other. This relates to foundation funding. The Promise Act would increase the base for low-income students up to 100%, while the governor's staff would be up to 52%. That's very concerning. At the end of the day it's not really increasing the baseline. The governor's proposal has accountability sitting with DESE. There is more meat in the Promise Act, it would be working with districts and holding them accountable, figuring out how the money is used in districts to be more transparent. Familiarize yourself with it. The piece that hasn't been talked about is the ELL piece. If this bill passes there is some language in there about ELL students but I think we should have a stronger voice. The Greater Boston Latino network will be doing some work around it and will be happy to share some public education. BSAC is hosting a youth-only forum on 2/28 on the foundation formula. As soon as the committee chairs are chosen in the Senate for the Education Committee, the biggest way to support is to call those chairs and tell them to hold a hearing. The second thing is for the supporters of the Promise Bill, to call them and thank them — Sonia Chang-Diaz in the Senate and someone in the House. I will forward information as I receive it to Jen.

FOLLOW-UP Obtain info about Promise Act from Alex and share with TF members.

Oliver-Dávila: No updates on the Superintendent Search. We are working with the search firm and they are hitting the ground talking with people. Hopefully we will have interviews in March and April.

Lee: We need to come to a consensus about who we want to nominate for the public panel.

Oliver-Dávila: You should nominate more than one.

Rice: I've been asking people around the country to recommend Latino or Latina candidates. I'm hearing that people are reluctant to come to Boston because the prior superintendent got kicked out after two years.

Mudd: I nominate Miren.

Mejia: I nominate Rev. Tan and Katie Li.

Later: Paulo De Barros is also interested in being nominated.

FOLLOW-UP Nominate four TF members as candidates for the public panels involved in the superintendent hire process.

4. OEL Director's Report (Priya Tahiliani)

• DOJ Update

• Funding concerns

Tahiliani: On side 2 is an overview of the reports due January 15th, it gives the high level. On the subsequent slides you can see the details for each report. See *presentation*.

Slide 6 — we have several administrators who have been on this list several years in a row, so we are working with them in particular.

Alex, Suzanne, Priya: Discussion about process at Welcome Center and prior practice that resulted in students who are identified to speak a language other than English having to wait longer to receive a school seat. Changed now so that all kindergartners are placed at the same time. Dr. Grandson recently went through the process with his child and found it confusing. Priya emphasizes that they are erring on the side of caution, do not want to be perceived that BPS is counseling students out of ELL services.

Oliver-Dávila: Where do the opt-outs occur? At the school level? Do they have to talk with someone at BPS first?

Tahiliani: There is an extensive process involving paperwork, a phone call, a meeting. OEL follows up with the school but not the family. We do push back on schools pretty hard tough, there are times we dig more deeply, especially if we see several opt-outs at the same school.

Note that slide 13 announces the formation of a WSF Working Group, that will include Budget, Finance, Planning and Analysis, Superintendent, OEL. Maybe add HC later. Many school leaders have made a request to participate.

Mejia: What about inviting the Office of Engagement? Hearing the concerns of parents and families could influence allocation decisions.

Lee: The test is an insufficient measure of how students are doing. Are there ways to give more weight to other measures? I know there are other measures that are used, but I am hearing about that. I am hearing from people who feel pushed to be in Gen Ed.

Tahiliani: We do always allow teacher and principal discretion. But last year we were finding some leveling that was very distant from the ACCESS score.

Mudd: Can we get trend data on ELD levels over time? how many students are moving ELD levels each year? [clarify with John]

FOLLOW-UP Speak with John to determine use of this trend data on ELD levels over time. Make data request.

Rice: I like the ideas on pages 12 and 13, but these are not in the current budget proposal at all. Is it right that they may or may not ever see the light of day, yes? So somebody who is in 9th grade might benefit if you could persuade someone to do something with these ideas?

Tahiliani: Yes, that is correct.

5. Funding ELL Programs and Services • Report on use of Title 1 Funds for ELLs (Anu Jayanth)

Jayanth: School allocation — Making sure every school submits an EL budget plan, and that activities through the year align to their plan. Also a new staff person for doing this work. District allocation — funds summer programs, about half of those specifically for ELs or to support the EL population as well; Parent University; offerings at the Welcome Centers; supports for Opportunity and Achievement Gap (Excellence for All); a coach for language acquisition at certain schools including Orchard Gardens, another program that works with targeted immigrant populations.

Three part approach for school-based funding: Budget phase; support through the school year; monitoring checklist at end of year. Any funds left at end of year from school allocations are returned to district for use on district programs.

Rice: Let's look at the 55%, about \$5.7 mil. When we met last summer we asked to see how those dollars were used for EL students, especially ELD 1 and 2. How are the dollars used, who did you hire, who is served? The answer was "we don't know" beyond very general answers. We were told it was just too hard to go back and figure out what we did last year. I wrote to the superintendent in August 2018 and pointed that out. I wrote to the superintendent about some millions that appeared to have been used for general purposes in SY17-18. I thought I might get a letter back saying 'no you are not right we can tell you how that money was spent for ELs' but that didn't happen. I got a letter back in January 2019. You're got to account for \$7 million, not potential crumbs. That was this year and why would next year be any different. I would hope that the school committee, the city council, if not the mayor himself could say how is this money being used for kids, not an insignificant group but the major cohort.

Kuder: I think a number of your characterizations are problematic, not the least of which is that I'm partnering with the ELL team and trying to do a thorough job, working with schools, putting controls in place in the procurement process, a 1 FTE investment to work between the finance teams and schools in accounting for this work. It's not an insignificant investment when you consider that are accounting team only has 2 people on it, our grants team only has 3 people on it. I think the commitment at the end of the year to ensure that dollars left over are reinvested is to make sure dollars are spent for their intended purpose. Our commitment here is to say, 'This is what this purpose was for, we're not repurposing it.' I think it's fun to characterize your questions in the way that you do to make it seem that we don't care, but that's a mischaracterization of the way our two teams have partnered.

Rice: You care, where's the money? It's not about you caring.

Lee: Is the same thing being asked of the central office?

Jayanth: We did go through the detail of the dollars at the district level. Yes, we try to focus more on the school allocations. We want to make sure we're getting it right.

Mudd: If in the past we haven't known the detail, are you saying that in the future we will get not just categories but something more specific to validate that the proportion intended for ELLs will go to ELs.

Jayanth: I want to clarify what you mean by services to ELs. The services are open to all but we take steps to make sure they are accessed by ELs. I can show you that of the 50 programs they were all accessible to ELs and 20 of them were targeted to ELs.

De Barros: Can you also pull out which group of ELs are receiving those funds, by language. I feel like I don't see that money for Cape Verdean.

Mejia: A few weeks ago I attended the meeting about budget cuts at the Blackstone and Nathan Hale. It struck me, the number of parents at the Blackstone were ELs. Can these dollars be allocated to support schools with those sorts of needs?

Lee: I think that might be a question for the general budget.

Kuder: At the Blackstone, part of what they're talking about was the need to reallocate dollars from what they felt was discretionary to something else, and then they had not appropriately staffed for the EL students so they had to make changes in the Budget Collab to adequately staff. We are very reluctant to make it seem that a school has to cut discretionary funding to achieve mandated EL students. This is an example of a place where we did put the focus on EL students to make sure they were getting appropriate services. At the Hale they are not getting a budget cut, their budget is increasing, but the principal has made a decision to increase core instruction with an impact on Specials time.

Lee: I'm glad you have all this check on schools, but who is checking central office?

Kuder: I think one of the reasons we have so much complexity at the school level is because we have 125 schools, each with their budget.

Tan: My question is around Family Engagement. It's pretty poor in my experience. I'm wondering how you are monitoring it and how you keep people accountable to what they say they will do around family engagement. I don't know how it's being proportioned out. We have been recommending that, because they level of family engagement is so low, that Title I funding is withheld until schools achieve certain levels of family engagement.

Jayanth: We do ask that schools allocate 1% of funds to engagement.

Tan: That's great on the process level, but where the rubber hits the road we need schools to withhold Title I funds.

Kuder: Something about the Internal Audit Group, a subcommittee, that they could include as part of a report-out.

De Barros: When the schools send their request for Title I, is OEL involved with that? I ask because the schools I work with, the things that can be invested in from Title I. For instance at the Burke, I see poor engagement, kids not getting services, what is happening? You spend millions of dollars every year but you don't see the impact. Family engagement, the schools that Cape Verdeans go to, it doesn't exist at all, it's not just that it's poor. Grandson: It sounds like an opportunity to get on the same page about what we're expecting from the 1%, what the impact can be. There are a lot of resources in schools, the greatest resource is often the FTEs, the staff. When we're talking about engagement it's usually 'how is the school coming together in additional time outside of the classroom to engage the community?' Especially because schools and principals may have some contractual obligations. In the time outside the instructional day, how do we make that process more transparent so we all can see the efforts that are going into family engagement.

Tan: Is the 1% a federal mandate? The answer came back yes. We've been talking for a long time about what constitutes good family engagement? Where is the accountability?

De Barros: I just feel sad because it's a big investment, federal dollars coming in. I feel like there needs to be some conversation because it's a lot of money, and I'm not seeing the impact in the community that I work with.

Oliver-Dávila: My understanding is that the family engagement expectations that will be included in principal evaluations should be very specific and should include information about how principals will address linguistic challenges. We need to change the paradigm so that it is every person in the school who will address that.

Li: At my school we lack basic materials, like putting report cards in several languages and having explanations for what letter and number grades mean. Also the foot soldiers in parent engagement are teachers. What resources are available to them? My best friend is google translate.

Tahiliani: Telephonic interpretation has been very successful for those who know about it, but it is relatively new.

• Final Presentation and Discussion of FY2020 Budget Proposals for ELL Programs and Services, Central Office and Schools (Eleanor Laurans, David Bloom, Nate Kuder)

Bloom: I'll start by addressing some of the questions I've already received.

- Look at the program detail, you'll see a big move of dollars from bilingual to dual language. It just reflects a code change in some of the accounting at the Hernandez.
- Also there was a change [totally missed it.]
- There was a position at Orchard Gardens for Cape Verdean that changed its classification.
- Something else that relates to a position at the West Roxbury Educational Complex, it is still in transition.

Tan: What is Dual Language Chinese and where is it? Is it existing or planned?

Tahiliani: It was the investment at the Quincy Upper that we did last year for a heritage language program. We can talk.

Tan: It's not going to be enough. They are going to need an extra FTE.

FOLLOW-UP Rev. Tan and Priya may want to follow up on the conversation about whether dollars budgeted for Dual Language Chinese at the Quincy Upper will be sufficient.

Mudd: What of this budget is invested in our new vision? I'll be honest, I'm a little impatient with saying 'This is up to schools.' It's a vision question. The other is that I'm a member of the ELSWD Subcommittee and I, one, don't know whether all of that money is in here, some of it presumably is in the Special Education budget. I went to one 1.5 hour probable org meeting and it just didn't come up.

Tahiliani: As I mentioned during out LOOK Act presentation we just got approval by DESE but need to get approval from DOJ. We are in the pilot mode, and during this coming year will be figuring out the mechanism for funding programs based on what we get approved by the DOJ.

Mudd: Are you saying that after this coming year we are not going to have any pilot programs?

Mudd: Looking for information about ELSWD allocations - how can we get those numbers?

Bloom: Maybe it would be worthwhile for us to come back and talk through a specific school example. These numbers are not readily available because you have to take the total dollars spent on EL services and multiply it by the percentage of students who are SWD in that class, etc.

Tan: When you know at what schools the pilot programs will be implemented, we'd like to know. **FOLLOW-UP** Learn from OEL which schools will implement pilot projects made possible by the LOOK Act.

Mejia: on page 3 of 3, contracted services. What are those for? Is an effort made to ensure that these are bilingual, culturally responsive, minority business owners?

Budget team: Sounds like not really.

Lee: What does bilingual teacher and bilingual kindergarten teacher refer to?

Budget team: any teacher in an EL program, nothing to do with whether the teacher is bilingual, maybe we need to change that name.

De Barros: External funds, Cape Verdean, can you help me understand what those funds pay for?

Bloom: External funds are likely the Title I dollars. Let's take a follow-up. We can break that out for you.

De Barros: The general fund is what pays teachers? Yes.

Bloom: SEI Portuguese and SEI Greek are mistakes.

Lee: We will have follow-up questions to get to you by email.

Bloom: That's great, we will get you a formal response.

FOLLOW-UP Request from Budget a breakdown of the costs covered by external funds and any other follow-up questions.

Kuder: The next full hearing for the budget is 3/7, at the Quincy Elementary School. 6 pm.

6. Human Capital • Subcommittee Concerns / Updates (Suzanne Lee and John Mudd, Co-chairs)

Lee: The big picture is that if we have a long way to go to get the right staffing. We did not clearly realize the magnitude of the problem until recently, that there were no requirements for SEI teachers to have native language skills. And over the last 12+ years we have lost a lot of our staff with language capacity. Especially, for example, Cape Verdean. If the district doesn't require it we aren't hiring people with that. Questions: Where does the district stand on the question of native language?

• Update on Language Diversity of Staff and Recruitment Plans (Emily Qazilbash)

Qazilbash: Introduction.

Barros: Context about the data. All of the language fluency data that we have is self-reported. Much of the data we have simply tells us the language and doesn't' give us nuanced data in terms of level of fluency in speaking, writing, translation, etc. Even with the limited data we have we don't really know what someone's skills are. We only have date on approximately half the teachers who are assigned to SEI strand courses. Approximately 2/3 of those we have data on do have language fluency in the language for the strand they teach. You can see that we have a bit more data this year than last; we were able to mine some data from our application system.

Li: This data shows the number of teachers r the number of classrooms?

Barros: Teachers.

Barros: This is a band-aid approach and it's going to take us a long time to get there.

Mudd: How are we going to get the data we need? How are we going to make changes in hiring practices to achieve the needs of the system? I know you've got targeted schools on racial diversity, should we also have targets on language diversity? We are hung up on this, and it's almost like we've hit a brick wall. If there is a commitment on the part of BPS to have some kind of match between the language of teachers and the language of students—what are we going to do about it?

Qazilbash: It's from the job description point, to the recruitment. Massachusetts does not actually have the number of teachers that we need. Then there's retention, primarily at the school level, but we can support district-wide through some approaches.

Mudd: What would be comfortable to me is that, from your best judgment, assuming that we all know that we've demonstrated huge problems. What are the things we need to deal with to inch up on it?

Lee: You're asking that question to everybody, right? Yes.

Oliver-Dávila: I agree with the idea of having targets like we have for race and ethnicity. Also if we advocate for the high school to teacher pipeline to be taken more seriously, making sure we

have colleges coming to the table to provide free tuition, for students of color, students with linguistic capacity, with guaranteed jobs in BPS, and also the housing piece because people can't afford to live here. I know it's a long time away, but it's a piece we need to blow up.

Qazilbash: In Denver they do have interesting programs around housing, where participants can get a sizeable down payment.

Mejia: I have a quick question about these comparisons. How are you measuring proficiency in terms of understanding the culture? Also how many of these are actually Latino Spanish speakers, they didn't go to Spain to learn the language.

Qazilbash: We do track by race/ethnicity. What I'm wondering is, do we track the intersection?

Barros: We don't. Our data system for race and ethnicity is so course-grained is that it would be really difficult to do that.

Lee: There's no license for it.

Mejia: You have to be able to understand the culture and their values. I know there's no measure for that, but it's important.

Qazilbash: I don't know if you've had Dr. Colin Rose in here.

Li: I think there's also another layer about whether the person you're hiring knows how to bridge cultures together. If you hire a Chinese teacher and they teach the way they teach in China, our pedagogy is completely different. They may be completely proficient in speaking, writing. Reading. I've seen plenty of teachers who hold a hard line with their students and then those students drop out. What I'm saying is 'Language proficiency for what purpose?'

Qazilbash: Do you see that as something that we can do at the central office? Where do you see the solution points?

Li: We're like 'We're going to get this data and then we do and we're like "We made it!"' Also the system has to support your capacity to do what you want to do. I'm talking about training and opportunities for that, and retaining teachers that way.

Tan: In order to create the paths from high school, the kids need to be nurtured in their native language right along the way. The heritage program, the bilingual seal of literacy. Al the work we're doing to get the district to be bilingual, it's never going to happen.

Li: Especially in the Asian-American community I see a lot of wanting to assimilate to this culture. So you have a generation of students who don't know the language, and are dealing with social pressure to assimilate. Sometimes the teachers' line is 'Speak English to me.' You have to have a very good understanding that 'I want you to be bilingual' as a teacher, not just 'I want you to learn English, it is important.' Teachers need to know that is' okay, they've internalized the English expectation.

Lee: It's not the job of HC to do that, we need an overall policy statement.

De Barros: One of the things that worked for me when I was a young teacher at the Burke, stayed there for 12 years. The bilingual program the way it was designed you don't get evaluated only by the principal but also by the coordinator. The coordinator who was there as very supportive. But now that relationship was sliced and there aren't that many bilingual teachers there anymore.

Lee: I know there are a lot of people who feel like transitional bilingual program did not work for people. It did not work for everybody. We have success in the Chinese, Cape Verdean, Vietnamese transitional program. You can look at those three and it's one culture. Spanish was not as successful. It's actually a multicultural classroom and it was not staffed as such. You don't have that strong component and that strong connection to community on the ground and you see that those programs are not as successful.

Qazilbash: I think this idea of having an overall policy statement from the top because they we have something to align to. I'm glad this group is pushing for that. Have you worked in BPS where there was this strong statement of policy from the top and what did that look like? Otherwise you have HC going in its direction, all the schools going in their directions.

FOLLOW-UP Provide OHC with guidance on what a policy statement from the top on staff language capacity might look like.

Rice: One observation. There's been a lot of talk about what we know and don't know and a lot of things point to the ideal. One practical thing would be for the leadership of the district to say to the teachers, "If you have teachers who speak the language of the teachers, encourage them to do so."

Lee: Teachers are not going to admit to that because what they don't want is to get called out from their classroom to interpret. It's an extra burden on them. I've been in that shoe before too. So I think it has to be more than that, there has to be some incentive to get more pay because it's a valued skill.

De Barros: For the Cape Verdean community, there was a program at UMass to get certified.

7. ELLTF Subcommittee Structure and Operations

Tan: I want to propose that the multilingual multicultural group becomes a subcommittee of the TF.

Oliver-Dávila: I'm here on a temporary basis and I can say I think you have too many meetings. I think we want to streamline and support especially the OEL staff, not burn them out. We need to streamline the process for meetings and data.

Tahiliani: One thing that would be helpful is if there is one place we could put all the requests so that we are not trying to sift through multiple emails and meeting notes

Oliver-Dávila: Have you reviewed your priorities? I know the subcommittees are tailored to the TF's priorities.

Lee: For me, the subcommittee structure is becoming overly structured, unwieldy to comply with Open Meeting and try to tackle some issues. When I started with the TF way back when I told

them what my commitment was and now it's grown to four times that. We need to look at some of the timing.

FOLLOW-UP Create a place online where all data requests are listed.

Tahiliani: The subcommittees are meeting more often than on the off months. If the original expectation is that it's on off months, what is the new expectation?

Mudd: What do you want us to stop? What do you want us to prioritize? We want to fulfill the mandate that the school committee charged us with, and I hear you saying this is too much.

Tahiliani: I am advocating for my team who also has a lot of pressures on their time. I do think that four meetings per year for a subcommittee is appropriate. It's a more efficient use of time. More meetings doesn't mean more gets done. They all run so differently. It's a different dynamic for every group, there are different ways of submitting requests. I know that at countless ELSWD meetings was the issue of language capacity and we cannot solve that there, so I was saying we need to move that to the HC meetings. What I would like to do is harness the power that the TF has. It becomes difficult for us to fulfill all of the demands for all of our stakeholders – DESE, DOJ, META, the ELLTF, more. We are meeting a lot of different priorities and we want to make sure we are using our time efficiently and effectively. I see that there is also budget and data.

Lee: I just scheduled a meeting with Charles for Thursday morning next week to talk about how to move the district forward.

Tahiliani: When we're making data requests. There are some that we do every year and those are important. There are some that I would ask the group, 'What is the action step with this data?' We had that previously, it had an action step, it was the whole issue around ELD leveling. Getting clear to about what are our priorities. We know that the whole reason we did that ELD leveling is that we know that EL students were in really wrong places and it was something principals were doing because of budgeting. That's why we did that whole initiative.

De Barros: I agree with you and the frustration of your staff and your advocacy for them. I think we need to separate out what are our responsibilities and what are those of staff? Then we can create an action plan. I go to the committees and I get frustrated, I want to see an end result. It's like when I go to the district and talk about Cape Verdean students — I am repeating myself and I hate repeating myself.

Tahiliani: One of the ways I see these subcommittee s working in partnership with us is to put some pressure. We see the subcommittees as being our support in getting things done with the other departments. We really want to see revised budgeting for ELs. We need to press Budget for that. Pressing on us doesn't do anything, I will just keep asking the same questions.

That's another thing that's not complete clear and I've asked Jen – which meetings do I need to be at?

Lee: Let's say 'Don't come unless we ask you to.'

De Barros: We need to get the work closer to the ground.

Decided: Create an Ad-hoc Multilingual Multicultural BPS group.

FOLLOW-UP Jen to schedule the meeting Ad-hoc Multilingual Multicultural BPS group has requested with BPS staff.

De Barros: I suggest that we need a follow-up document for the subcommittees.

Tahiliani: It's too many places to go. We need one place to get all the information.

8. Public Comment

Welcomed in the above agenda sections.

9. Adjourn